

# MEETING MINUTES



MEETING **Heritage Guelph**

DATE November 13, 2013

LOCATION City Hall Committee Room 'A'

TIME 1:00 PM

PRESENT Daphne Wainman-Wood (Chair), Paul Ross, Martin Bosch, Bill Green, Tony Berto, Susan Ratcliffe, Joel Bartlett, Stephen Robinson (Senior Heritage Planner), Michelle Mercier (Recording Secretary)

REGRETS Russell Ott, Doug Haines, Christopher Campbell, Lorraine Pagnan, Mary Tivy

DELEGATIONS Yorklands Green Hub: Norah Chaloner; Michael Shook; Karl Grottenthaler  
12 Inkerman St: Grant Worton (proponent)  
5 Arthur St: Larry Kotseff (Fusion Homes); Edwin Rowse (ERA Architects); Katie Nasswetter (Senior Development Planner)  
170 and 178 Elizabeth St: Hugh Peloso and Brian Marquess (real estate representatives for owner)

## DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM #	DESCRIPTION
--------	-------------

1	<b><u>Welcome and Opening Remarks</u></b> Daphne Wainman-Wood welcomed everyone to the meeting.
2	<b><u>Approval of Agenda</u></b> Moved by Paul Ross and seconded by Martin Bosch, <b>“THAT the Agenda for the Heritage Guelph meeting of November 13, 2013 be approved.”</b> CARRIED
3	<b><u>Declaration of Pecuniary Interest</u></b> None
4	<b><u>Approval of Meeting Minutes from October 16, 2013</u></b> Moved by Tony Berto and seconded by Bill Green, <b>“THAT the Minutes from the meeting of October 16, 2013 be approved.”</b> CARRIED

<p>5</p>	<p><b><u>Matters Arising from Previous Minutes</u></b></p> <p><b>Item 5.1</b> <b>178 Elizabeth Street</b></p> <p>Delegations: Hugh Peloso and Brian Marquess (real estate representatives for owner)</p> <p>Stephen Robinson provided a review of previous discussions and showed some additional photos of the house located at 178 Elizabeth Street. Stephen added that the paired front windows are not unique but are rare, and that there are only two other examples in Guelph that present a 5-bay front façade in a Gothic Revival farmhouse. Stephen added that although there is no known historical associative value to the house, the physical and contextual elements are strong heritage attributes to support a recommendation to designate under the Ontario Heritage Act.</p> <p>Committee members held a discussion on the condition of the brick exterior. Tacoma Engineering’s structural assessment report indicates that more than 20% of the bricks need to be replaced and that the cost to restore the brick exterior is cost prohibitive. It was noted that the rear addition is not likely original to the house. Some Committee members indicated that they do not feel the property is worthy of designation due to its physical integrity.</p> <p>Moved by Martin Bosch and seconded by Bill Green,</p> <p><b>“THAT Heritage Guelph will not recommend designation of the house at 178 Elizabeth Street and has no objection to the removal of the structure provided that the owner or proponent work with Heritage Planning staff to determine and retain any architectural elements of the building that may be practically salvaged for reuse.”</b></p> <p style="text-align: right;">CARRIED</p> <p>Moved by Paul Ross and seconded by Bill Green,</p> <p><b>“THAT Heritage Guelph has no objection to the proposed removal of 170 and 178 Elizabeth Street from the City of Guelph’s <i>Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties</i>; and</b></p> <p><b>THAT Heritage Guelph has no objection to the proposed demolition of the existing house at 170 Elizabeth Street, provided that the owner or proponent work with Heritage Planning staff to determine and retain any architectural elements of the building that may be practically salvaged for reuse and that the owner or proponent create, at their own expense, a commemorative feature on-site to recognize both the houses that were originally on the site and also to show how the Franchetto family conducted a market garden/greenhouse business from the premises for 43 years. “</b></p> <p style="text-align: right;">CARRIED</p>
<p>6</p>	<p><b>New Business</b></p> <p><b>Item 6.1</b> <b>12 Inkerman Street</b></p>

Delegations: Grant Worton (proponent)

Stephen Robinson advised that he has received a request to remove the property at 12 Inkerman Street from the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties. Stephen added that the proponent is proposing demolition of the existing house and building a new dwelling on the site. The existing house is listed on the Municipal Register but is not designated. Stephen provided some photos he took at a recent site visit. Stephen added that the house is not in good condition and has lost much of its physical integrity, that there is no real heritage value remaining and that there is no known historical associative value to the house.

Some Committee members added that they would prefer if there was an option to build a 2-storey house to match neighbouring properties rather than match the existing dwelling design and Grant Worton advised that he would like to have that option available as well.

Moved by Paul Ross and seconded by Tony Berto,

**“THAT Heritage Guelph has no objection to the proposed removal of 12 Inkerman Street from the City of Guelph’s *Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties*; and**

**THAT Heritage Guelph has no objection to the proposed demolition of the existing dwelling at 12 Inkerman Street provided that the proponent consider incorporating the following design elements into the proposed replacement dwelling design:**

- **a single-storey dwelling with a side gable main roof with pitch and proportions appropriate for a 3-bay front façade with board and batten exterior cladding (using painted wood or Hardi-Board material) or a 2-storey home in keeping with the characteristic of the neighbourhood**
- **detached garage set back to the rear of property”**

CARRIED

## **Item 6.2**

### **5 Arthur Street South**

Delegations: Larry Kotseff (Fusion Homes); Edwin Rowse (ERA Architects);  
Staff: Katie Nasswetter (Senior Development Planner)

Stephen Robinson provided some background to the development of 5 Arthur Street South. Stephen advised that the proponent is recommending that the heritage wall along the river be carefully dismantled and that only a small portion (approximately 22’) be reconstructed at the original corner near the heritage building complex.

Edwin Rowse advised that the original interior wall has been deteriorating due to the bricks being exposed to the weather. The proponent is considering taking down the wall and rebuilding a 22’ section using only the exterior bricks. Edwin added that it would be cost prohibitive to rebuild a large amount of the wall.

Committee members raised some concerns with only rebuilding a small section of the wall. They noted that currently the wall is about 200' in length with 33 window openings and that the length of the wall is an important feature. Committee members suggested rebuilding a number of small sections throughout the full length of the wall to give the viewer a better understanding of the original Buildings 3 and 4.

Committee members also noted that they have concerns that a use has not yet been determined for the heritage building complex and would like to have the buildings documented and measured drawings created. Members suggested that a charette could be held to determine ideas for the reuse of the building. Larry Kotseff advised that they are still looking at using the "Distillery Building" as a sales presentation centre and that they would consider more consultation with community members on the final use.

Committee members held some discussion on the staff recommendation. Larry raised some concerns over the timing indicated in the recommendation and that the development of river walk or promenade will be done with the City and that the details still need to be worked out. Katie Nasswetter provided some clarification on some details with the recommendation. Katie will send Stephen a list of proposed uses allowed by the zoning by-law amendment for the Distillery Building.

Moved by Martin Bosch, Seconded by Paul Ross,

**"THAT Heritage Guelph has no objection to the proponent's proposal to dismantle and reconstruct (in part) the brick river walls of Buildings #3 and #4 at 5 Arthur Street South provided that the proponent, in consultation with their heritage consultant (ERA Architects):**

- **completely document the existing structure through photographs and measured drawings before dismantling begins**
- **determine how many exterior bricks, stone sills, etc. can be successfully salvaged for re-use in the reconstruction**
- **That upon determination of the amount of salvageable brick from the wall, that upon demolition that brick is properly stored until the final plans for the reconstructed river wall are implemented**
- **determine, in consultation with and to the satisfaction of Heritage Guelph, the representative length of the brick river wall that may be reconstructed with the salvaged material available**
- **determine, in consultation with and to the satisfaction of Heritage Guelph, the heritage interpretive panels that would be supplied and installed on site at the proponent's expense; and**

**THAT Heritage Guelph requests the proponents to provide professionally prepared measured drawings of heritage buildings #1 and #2 on the site at 5 Arthur Street South, to be available to the Owners and Heritage Guelph by March, 2014. Drawings should include floor plans of all building levels including roof plans, all building elevations and a cross section for each building."**

CARRIED

7	<p><b><u>Information Items</u></b></p> <p><b>Item 7.1 Yorklands Green Hub</b></p> <p>Delegation: Norah Chaloner; Michael Shook; Karl Grottenthaler</p> <p>Norah Chaloner provided an overview of the Yorklands Green Hub proposal for the former Guelph Correctional Centre lands. Norah advised that the group was formed out of the City’s Community Well Being initiative and they are primarily interested in using the correctional facility for education and training for food and water initiatives. Norah advised that they have met with MPP Liz Sandals to gain provincial support and that they are also working with many local organizations and businesses. They are in the process of applying for incorporation and then will be applying for charitable status. They have also applied for an Expression of Interest to the province and are putting together a coalition to manage the project.</p> <p>Committee Members noted that Heritage Guelph has been working with the Province on saving and protecting the cultural heritage features on the site and that their plans work well with what Heritage Guelph has been working on and would be supportive. Susan added that the ACO will be holding a tour of the buildings on Saturday, November 23 however you must be a member of ACO to attend.</p> <p>Daphne Wainman-Wood thanked the guests for attending.</p>
8	<p><b><u>Next Meeting</u></b></p> <p>Working Group Meeting(s) – Monday, November 25, 2013 in City Hall Meeting Room “B” Regular Meeting – Monday, December 9, 2013 in City Hall Meeting Room “B”</p>
9	<p><b><u>Other Matters Introduced by the Chair or Heritage Guelph Members</u></b></p> <p>None</p>
10	<p><b><u>Adjournment</u></b></p> <p>Adjourn – 3:25 pm</p>