

MEETING MINUTES



MEETING **Heritage Guelph**

DATE October 16, 2013

LOCATION City Hall Committee Room 'D'

TIME 2:00 PM

PRESENT Daphne Wainman-Wood (Chair), Paul Ross, Martin Bosch, Bill Green, Tony Berto, Lorraine Pagnan, Mary Tivy, Susan Ratcliffe, Joel Bartlett, Stephen Robinson (Senior Heritage Planner), Michelle Mercier (Recording Secretary)

REGRETS Russell Ott, Doug Haines, Christopher Campbell

DELEGATIONS 170 and 178 Elizabeth St: Owen Scott (CHC Consulting); Hugh Peloso and Brian Marquess (real estate agents for owner) Taylor McDaniel (proponent)

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM #	DESCRIPTION
1	<u>Welcome and Opening Remarks</u> Daphne Wainman-Wood welcomed everyone to the meeting.
2	<u>Approval of Agenda</u> Moved by Mary Tivy and seconded by Tony Berto, “THAT the Agenda for the Heritage Guelph meeting of October 16, 2013 be approved.” CARRIED
3	<u>Declaration of Pecuniary Interest</u> None
4	<u>Approval of Meeting Minutes from September 9, 2013</u> Moved by Paul Ross and seconded by Tony Berto, “THAT the Minutes from the meeting of September 9, 2013 be approved.” CARRIED

Matters Arising from Previous Minutes

Item 5.1

80 Simmonds Drive

Stephen Robinson provided an update on the status of the Wilson Farmhouse located at 80 Simmonds Drive. Stephen advised that the issue was before Council on September 30th and although there were 6 motions put forward, they all ended in a 6-6 tie and no motions were passed. Councillor Piper will be putting forward a new motion at the November 4th meeting. Daphne Wainman-Wood reviewed the four options that were presented to Council. The Committee held some discussion on the options and made the following comments:

- That the house is an important part of our cultural heritage and should be retained
- That the Committee would only support options 1 and 2
- Council previously accepted Heritage Guelph's advice to designate
- The Conservation Review Board reviewed the appeal of Council's Intention to Designate and determined that it is appropriate to designate
- The Official Plan indicates that the former farmhouse is to be used for either community or residential use
- That under the Ontario Heritage Act, there is no deadline for Council to make a decision on the heritage designating of the house

Paul Ross noted that in Heritage Guelph's presentation to Council should refute previously raised points that were incorrect. Daphne advised that organizations can have more than one delegation appear at Council meetings and that each representative will still get 5 minutes to present. Daphne added that Heritage Guelph needs to emphasize our mandate during the presentation.

Moved by Mary Tivy and seconded by Lorraine Pagnan,

“THAT Heritage Guelph reaffirms its commitment to the designation of 80 Simmonds Drive under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act as previously recommended by Heritage Guelph and City Council and the Conservation Review Board and that to this end Heritage Guelph recommends the option of either retaining the property (as described in the original motion of intention to designate February 28, 2011) for Community Use or alternatively for residential use as identified in the Official Plan of the City of Guelph 2001 (December 2012 Consolidation) – Section 3.5.20.”

CARRIED

Item 5.2

170 and 178 Elizabeth Street

Delegations: Owen Scott (CHC Consulting); Hugh Peloso and Brian Marquess (real estate agents for owner), Taylor McDaniel (proponent)

Stephen Robinson advised that Gerry Zegerius of Tacoma Engineering has provided some updated information for the house at 178 Elizabeth Street including a Building Condition Assessment Report and that he has received a supplementary report from Owen Scott on the Heritage Impact

Assessment. Stephen reviewed photos and the proposed site plan for the property.

Stephen advised that, in general, Planning's position is that they wouldn't support the proposal as presented and that they would require a re-zoning of the property and not just a Committee of Adjustment application for severance and variances.

Stephen noted that heritage would be considered as part of the larger zoning application, that the Planning Services is also requesting a Tree Conservation Plan and that the demolition permit is premature. Stephen added that if this proposal goes through a re-zoning application, then the demolition would be done as part of the re-zoning instead of under the Demolition Control by-law.

Stephen reviewed Doug Haines' comments and noted that although there are issues with the painted brick veneer needing repair, these may not be structural issues. Stephen noted that although the coupling or pairing of the front windows is not rare, the house has a 5-bay front elevation under a front centre gable with a gothic window.

Committee members made the following comments:

- That it is premature to consider demolition until we see an alternative site plan that was previously requested showing the retention of the house.
- Not enough research has been done on the house
- Questions on if the architectural style is unique or more common
- Concerns over the condition of the brick veneer
- Some members feel due to its condition, that the house isn't worth saving

Stephen added that it is one of the earlier houses on the Elizabeth St streetscape and that it is important for its architectural value in that it is an uncommon design.

Taylor McDaniel noted that they have some major restrictions on the site including the easement and railway setback which limits the amount of buildable area and that they need to know if Heritage Guelph is planning on designating the building before they can move forward with the project. Owen Scott added that the house is not special and would cost more money to restore than it is worth.

Moved by Lorraine Pagnan and seconded by Tony Berto,

“THAT Heritage Guelph defers the decision for a recommendation on the designation of 178 Elizabeth Street until the proper re-zoning application is brought forward to the Planning Department and a public meeting is held.”

DEFEATED

Moved by Joel Bartlett and seconded by Tony Berto,

“THAT Heritage Guelph defers the decision for a recommendation on the designation of 178 Elizabeth Street until the meeting of November 12 so that the cultural heritage value can be determined.”

CARRIED

	<p>Committee members held further discussion on the condition of the brick veneer on the house. Stephen will request a meeting on site with the structural engineer to examine more closely the condition status of the exterior brick.</p> <p>The Committee held discussion on the types of materials that are required when applications for demolition are brought to Heritage Guelph.</p> <p>Moved by Paul Ross and seconded by Lorraine Pagnan,</p> <p>“In instances where Heritage Guelph is requested to provide a recommendation on the proposed demolition of a non-designated but listed heritage building, Heritage Guelph will require the applicant to provide a Heritage Impact Assessment as required by the Official Plan and a Structural Report on the property as a requirement to consider the application for demolition.”</p> <p style="text-align: right;">CARRIED</p> <p>Item 5.3 Result of Heritage District Community Focus Workshop (October 2)</p> <p>Stephen Robinson provided an update on the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage District Community Focus Workshop held on October 2nd. Stephen advised that 28 people attended the workshop and there were 4 rotating breakout groups created to discuss the key topics. Stephen added that there was good discussion on the key topics and that the next step will be the release of the draft HCD plan policies and design guidelines.</p> <p>Item 5.4 Methods for Cleaning Limestone</p> <p>Stephen Robinson advised that limestone cleaning is currently taking place at 47-51 Cork St and that the owners have received a downtown façade improvement grant for the work. Stephen showed some pictures of the work already completed and commented that he is satisfied with the results.</p>
6	<p>New Business</p> <p>Item 6.1 148-160 Delhi Street and 147, 151, 155-157 Delhi Street</p> <p>Stephen Robinson advised that the Homewood is proposing a new building beside the Manor Building. Stephen briefly described the proposed site plan currently under review by the Site Plan Review Committee. Stephen noted that the Homewood will be retaining the Manor Building however they would be relocating the Cameron Gates and eliminating the buildings on the opposite side of Delhi Street (147, 151, 155-157 Delhi Street) for additional parking. Planning staff have requested that a site visit (including Heritage Guelph) to see the building exterior and interiors of all buildings in question. Stephen added that a Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment will be a requirement of a complete Site Plan Review Application and that the CHRIA will need to address the cultural heritage landscape of the Homewood site complex.</p>

7	<u>Information Items</u> Susan Ratcliffe advised that the ACO Building Stories meeting will be held tonight in City Hall.
8	<u>Next Meeting</u> Working Group Meeting(s) – Monday, October 28, 2013 in City Hall Meeting Room “B” Regular Meeting – Monday, November 12, 2013 in City Hall Meeting Room “B”
9	<u>Other Matters Introduced by the Chair or Heritage Guelph Members</u> None
10	<u>Adjournment</u> Adjourn – 4:15 pm