

HERITAGE GUELPH
Municipal Heritage Committee

NOTICE OF MEETING

**A meeting of Heritage Guelph will be held from
* 11:30 am until 2:00 p.m.
Monday, 12 March 2012**

(*Please note starting time above.)

1 Carden St., New City Hall COMMITTEE ROOM B (Main Floor)

Please Note: Delegations must register by 12:00 noon on the Thursday prior to the meeting. To register as a delegate, please call 519-837-5616 or email planning@guelph.ca. Delegations will be allocated a maximum of 5 minutes to present their opinions to the committee. Persons not registering by the deadline will not be allowed to address the committee.

A G E N D A

- 1. Welcome and Opening Remarks**
- 2. Approval of Agenda**
- 3. Declarations of Pecuniary Interest**
- 4. Adoption of Minutes from January 23, 2012 meeting of Designation Research and Heritage Review Sub-Committee**
- 5. Adoption of Minutes from February 13, 2012 meeting of Heritage Guelph**
- 6. Matters arising from the Minutes**
- 7. New Business**
 - Item 7.1 Heritage Guelph Committee procedures – Paul Ross**
 - Item 7.2 Presentation on cultural heritage resources and the University of Guelph Campus Master Plan**

Delegation: Gord Gavrilovic (Manager, Space & Facility Renewal Physical Resources, University of Guelph); Warren Price and Benjamin Hoff (Urban Strategies)
 - Item 7.3 72 Farquhar Street (Drill Hall Building)**

Discussion of proposed Conservation Plan
Delegation: Greg Ashbee (Manager, Infrastructure Environmental Assessment Manager, Rail Facilities, GO Transit)
 - Item 7.4 785 York Road (Guelph Correctional Centre)**

Discussion of result of March 9 site visit with Infrastructure Ontario staff
 - Item 7.5 344 Woolwich Street**

Discussion of proposed chimney replacement
 - Item 7.6 La Guayra Settlers Plaque in John Galt Park**

Discussion of proposed re-location to Marden area.
- 8. Working Group Reports**
 - Communications**
 - Item 8.1 Spotlight on Heritage event (February 18)
 - Item 8.2 Plaque presentation ceremony at Council Feb 27

Designation Research and Heritage Review

- Item 8.3 170-178 Elizabeth Street - Discussion of site visit requested by real estate agent in presale consultation
- Item 8.4 14 Neeve Street (Law House) - Sale of property and site visit
- Item 8.5 366 College Avenue West (Janefield) - Sale of property and site visit

9. Information Items

- Item 9.1 Update regarding current HG membership vacancy
- Item 9.2 Ontario Heritage Conference, Kingston (May 31 to June 3, 2012)

10. Next Meeting:

Heritage Guelph

- * Tuesday, 10 April 2012 (12:00 – 2:00 pm) (*to be confirmed)
- Location: City Hall, Meeting Room B

11. Other matters introduced by the Chair or Heritage Guelph members

MEETING MINUTES



MEETING **Heritage Guelph – Designation Research and Heritage Review Sub-Committee**

DATE January 23, 2012

LOCATION City Hall Committee Room ‘B’

TIME 12:00 PM

PRESENT Paul Ross (Chair), Lorraine Pagnan, Mary Tivy, Martin Bosch, Daphne Wainman-Wood, Tony Berto, Stephen Robinson (Senior Heritage Planner)

GUESTS Wendy Shearer (MHBC Planning)

REGRETS Susan Ratcliffe, Joel Bartlett, Russell Ott, Doug Haines, Christopher Campbell

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM #	DESCRIPTION
1	<p><u>Welcome and Opening Remarks</u> Paul Ross welcomed all to the meeting.</p>
2	<p><u>Approval of Agenda</u></p>
3	<p><u>Declaration of Pecuniary Interest:</u> None.</p>
4	<p>Item 4.1 Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Study</p> <p>Stephen Robinson and Paul Ross began the discussion by reminding the committee members that at the 9 January 2012 meeting of Heritage Guelph members were asked to review the Brooklyn and College Hill HCD Study – Heritage Assessment Report (made available on-line on 10 January 2012), the consultant’s findings and the recommended district boundary, and to send any comments or concerns via email to Daphne, Russell, Paul and Stephen. Stephen suggested that the results of the second Public Meeting for the first phase of the Heritage Conservation District Study (held January 17) should also be discussed. Stephen suggested that the main function of the discussion of the present meeting was to create a suggested recommendation for Heritage Guelph to consider at its 13 February meeting as to whether they support Council proceeding with Phase 2 of the HCD designation process involving further public consultation and the creation of a draft HCD Plan and Design Guidelines. Stephen also stated that Wendy Shearer of MHBC Planning has offered to attend the meeting at 12:30 to take part in discussion.</p> <p>Paul Ross described the turnout at the second Public Meeting (held January 17) as including Ward 5 Councillor Leanne Piper and Councillors Andy VanHellemond and Jim Furfaro. However, the meeting was not well attended by the general public. He noticed that the focus of discussion tended to be on what members of the audience felt were negative aspects of a proposed HCD. The</p>

	<p>media reportage following the Public Meeting also seemed to pick up on these negative sentiments. The committee members felt that if Council were to decide to proceed to Phase 2 of the HCD process, that efforts would need to be made to increase the amount of community turnout and participation in the consultation meetings.</p> <p>At 12:30, Wendy Shearer of MHBC Planning and member of the consultant team for the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Study arrived at the meeting.</p> <p>Discussion moved to the consultant’s proposed HCD boundary. The members present indicated that they were generally pleased with the proposed boundary and with the consultant’s recommendation to include the Speed River riverscape area from the Wellington Street Dam east to the confluence of the Speed and Eramosa Rivers and to include James Street East. The addition of University of Guelph and Macdonald Stewart Art Centre lands on the east side of Gordon Street, property on the northwest corner of College Avenue and Gordon Street as well as properties on the west side of Mary Street were seen as important areas to include within the proposed district. Wendy Shearer was asked to explain the justification for the inclusion of the new areas and the explanation appeared to the committee members present to adequately justify including these areas as important elements of the proposed district.</p> <p>The committee members discussed their understanding that the main question at hand is not whether Council should give final approval of this area a Heritage District. Paul Ross reiterated the fact that the first phase of the Brooklyn and College HCD process is coming to a conclusion, and that the consultant’s have provided the necessary background material required for the study process and that they now recommend that Council proceed to the second phase. A draft HCD Plan and Design Guidelines will provide more opportunity for further community consultation and for further input from all stakeholders. Paul Ross and Stephen Robinson both reiterated that it is quite possible that many of the current concerns held by members of the public will be addressed and solutions found through a well-written HCD Plan created through continued meaningful community consultation.</p> <p>The committee members felt that having reviewed the HCD Study report for the Brooklyn and College Hill HCD, they feel the report was good, thorough and comprehensive. There was consensus among the Heritage Guelph committee members present at the meeting that they would urge all members of Heritage Guelph to support a recommendation for Council to receive the final Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Study – Heritage Assessment Report and that the process should proceed to the second phase of the HCD process so that draft HCD Plan and Design Guidelines may be produced and used to assist further community consultation on the matter.</p>
5	<p><u>Information Items</u></p>
6	<p><u>Next Meeting</u></p> <p>Regular Meeting - Monday, February 13, 2012 in City Hall Meeting Room “B”.</p>

7	<u>Other Matters Introduced by the Chair or Heritage Guelph Members</u> None Adjourned – 1:45 pm

DRAFT

MEETING MINUTES



MEETING **Heritage Guelph**

DATE February 13, 2012

LOCATION City Hall Committee Room 'B'

TIME 12:00 PM

PRESENT Paul Ross (Chair), Lorraine Pagnan, , Martin Bosch, Russell Ott, Daphne Wainman-Wood, Joel Bartlett, Tony Berto, Susan Ratcliffe, Stephen Robinson (Senior Heritage Planner), Michelle Mercier (Recording Secretary)

REGRETS Doug Haines, Mary Tivy, Christopher Campbell

DELEGATIONS Mr. Bob Carter, Assistant Vice-President, Physical Resources (University of Guelph) and Ms. Jill Vigers, Manager, Architectural Services, Design, Engineering & Construction (University of Guelph)

AUDIENCE Mr. Rick Jamieson

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM #	DESCRIPTION
--------	-------------

1	<u>Welcome and Opening Remarks</u> Paul Ross welcomed all to the meeting.
2	<u>Approval of Agenda:</u> Moved by Joel Bartlett and seconded by Lorraine Pagnan, “THAT the Agenda for the February 13, 2012 meeting of Heritage Guelph be approved.” CARRIED
3	<u>Declaration of Pecuniary Interest:</u> none
4	<u>Approval of Meeting Minutes from January 9, 2012</u> Moved by Tony Berto and seconded by Russell Ott, “THAT the Minutes for the January 9, 2012 meeting of Heritage Guelph be approved.” CARRIED

Matters Arising from Previous Minutes

Item 5.1

Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District

Mr. Rick Jamieson, an owner of property on James Street East in the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Study area, attended this portion of the meeting. Although not as a registered delegation, the Chair allowed Mr. Jamieson to address the committee. Mr. Jamieson raised his concerns about the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Study process, alleged inaccuracies in the consultant's HCD Study – Heritage Assessment Report, and his concern that his property and all other properties on James Street East, in his opinion, do not have heritage value and that he and his neighbours on James Street East don't want a Heritage District. Mr. Jamieson added that he believes designating individual properties is a better way to go about preserving heritage and that the HCD Study is too expensive and not necessary. Mr. Jamieson also commented that he is concerned that the committee and the City are making a decision based on flawed information. Paul Ross suggested to Mr. Jamieson that Heritage Guelph isn't the proper forum for his concerns, and that he needs to present them to Council.

Moved by Tony Berto and seconded by Susan Ratcliffe,

“THAT Heritage Guelph recommends that Council receive the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District Study – Heritage Assessment Report (February 2012); and

THAT, having thoroughly reviewed the study report in consultation with a member of the consultant team, Heritage Guelph advises Council of its support for proceeding with Phase Two of the Brooklyn and College Hill Heritage Conservation District designation process for the purposes of creating a Draft Heritage Conservation District Plan and Design Guidelines according to Part V, Section 40 (1) of the Ontario Heritage Act.”

CARRIED

Item 5.2

139 Morris Street

Paul Ross advised that the committee needs to make a recommendation to Planning Staff on Heritage Guelph's position on the proposed redevelopment of 139 Morris Street. The information provided by the proponent in the Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment indicates that it would be impossible to incorporate the 1907 portion of the building into the new development. The report notes that significant changes have already been made to the original building over the years causing the loss of heritage integrity and that there appears to be extensive remediation required for the environmental cleanup which makes it difficult for the building to remain on the site.

Committee members again raised issues relating to the importance and distinctiveness of the building in the community and that it is desirable to reuse portions of the building, if possible. Members also noted that some aspects of CHRIA have not been met in that it does not address possible adaptive reuse plans, there is no assessment of the building to indicate that parts of the original building can/cannot be re-used, nor is there proper documentation of the existing floor plan. One member noted that if the building is eventually demolished some heritage components of the original building should be retained and that the Guelph Civic Museum should be given an opportunity to see what artifacts they would consider adding to their collection. Paul Ross noted that the committee is lacking

	<p>significant information to make a decision at this point.</p> <p>Stephen Robinson advised the committee that the only way to preserve this non-listed built heritage resource is to designate it under the Ontario Heritage Act. The committee needs to determine if it wants to start the designation process. Stephen Robinson will follow up with the proponent and Planning Staff regarding the additional information the Committee is requesting.</p> <p>Item 5.3 785 York Road (Guelph Correctional Centre) Stephen Robinson announced that he has made arrangements with Infrastructure Ontario for a site visit at the former Guelph Correctional Centre at 785 York Road on either March 8 or 9th. The Committee members determined March 9th, from 10:30-1:00 as their preferred date.</p>
6	<p>Business Items</p> <p>Item 6.1 573, 575, 577-579 and 581 Gordon Street (University of Guelph) Delegation: Mr. Bob Carter, Assistant Vice-President, Physical Resources (U of G) and Ms. Jill Vigers, Manager, Architectural Services, Design, Engineering & Construction (U of G) attended this portion of the meeting.</p> <p>Ms. Jill Vigers advised that the University of Guelph is planning on demolishing the four red brick houses at 573, 575, 577-579 and 581 Gordon Street and provided some background information on the properties. She advised that none of the houses are designated or listed on the Heritage Register under the Ontario Heritage Act. The houses were built to house staff and faculty in the late 1800's and early 1900's. The properties now have limited use and functionality and they don't fit into the University's Campus Master Plan. 573, 575 and 577-579 Gordon Street are currently being used for storage and office space while 581 Gordon Street is not habitable and is not being used. Ms. Vigers added that it would be hard to adapt these buildings for other uses due to the relative floor plates of the buildings and the University has no real use for them anymore. It was explained that the University would like to design a symbolic plaque or memorial to recognize the people who the houses are named after.</p> <p>Members asked what they plan to build in the location if the houses were to be demolished or if the houses could be moved to another location, or incorporated wholly or partially into a new building on the site. Bob Carter replied that they haven't identified a specific use as yet however it is a valuable spot and the University plans to build there at a later date. Jill Vigers responded that relocation or incorporation would not be practical and that the Young house is in very poor condition. It was noted that the houses can't be used as a residence or day care due to Ministry of Environment regulations and that there are limited uses available for the site.</p> <p>Stephen Robinson noted that as the properties are not designated and have not been listed on the Heritage Register, if the Committee would like to save them, they would need to recommend that Council designate the houses under the Ontario Heritage Act. Stephen noted that the Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment provided by Owen Scott on behalf of the proponent offered very limited structural analysis and asked what the concerns were for the structural condition of the Young house. Bob noted that although structurally it seems okay, there are issues with mould, animals, mortar missing, probably water damage, porches have rotting columns, roofing issues, and the</p>

windows are showing rot damage.

A question was asked about the timing of the demolition and if there was a rush to demolish. Bob Carter commented that Urban Strategies is currently working on a new Campus Master Plan for the University lands and the UofG needs to be ready if a project comes up that they need the land for. The 2002 Campus Master Plan showed the land as a future building site so they have been proposed for demolition for 10 years and as such, haven't been maintained to the extent that they could have been. Bob added that they could build quite a large building on the site and meet more needs than if they kept the houses intact.

Moved by Martin Bosch and seconded by Russell Ott,

“THAT Heritage Guelph having no interest in designating the properties located at 573, 575, 577-579 and 581 Gordon Street will not oppose the University of Guelph’s application for the demolition of such.”

CARRIED

Moved by Martin Bosch and seconded by Russell Ott,

“However, Heritage Guelph requires that the University of Guelph take inventory, pictorially and otherwise to document the present structures. Also the University of Guelph is required to recycle whatever aspects of the buildings that is possible. e.g. red brick, wooden doors, windows etc. In addition the University of Guelph will prepare signage on site that recognizes the significance and naming of the 4 houses.”

CARRIED

Paul Ross added that the Committee would be interested in meeting with University about their Master Planning process. Paul and Stephen will contact the University to set up a meeting. Paul thanked the guests for attending.

Item 6.2

72 Farquhar Street (Guelph Kiss-and-Ride)

Stephen Robinson advised that there is a Site Plan application submitted for the Kiss and Ride location at 72 Farquhar Street and the demolition of the building has been completed. Representatives of GO Transit will be coming to a future meeting of Heritage Guelph to provide an update of their plans for the Drill Hall.

Item 6.3

170-178 Elizabeth Street

Stephen Robinson advised that he has been contacted by a real estate agent regarding the property at 170-178 Elizabeth Street which will be listed for sale. Both of the houses are listed on the Heritage Register and the Agent is looking to see what the Committee’s position is on these properties. Stephen will advise when he arranges a site visit.

7	<p><u>Subcommittee and Committee Representation</u></p> <p>Item 7.1 Spotlight on Heritage Event (February 18) Susan Ratcliffe provided an update on the Spotlight on Heritage Event being held at Stone Road Mall this weekend. Susan will send out an amended schedule for all those who have volunteered. The display will include posters and brochures and there will be 20 other heritage groups involved. If anyone has other display suggestions, please let Susan know.</p> <p>Item 7.2 Plaque presentation ceremony at Council February 27 Stephen Robinson confirmed that the heritage designation plaques are ready for the ceremony to be held at the beginning of the Council meeting on February 27. The ceremony will consist of a Powerpoint presentation and the presentation of the plaques to the recipients by the Mayor.</p> <p>Item 7.3 Guelph Civic Museum tour for HG and plaque recipients The Committee discussed the possibility of holding a reception for the plaque recipients before the February 27 ceremony and then invite them for a tour of the museum at a later date.</p>
8	<p><u>Information Items</u></p> <p>8.1 Heritage Research Assistant – update on summer position Stephen Robinson informed the Committee that Jesse Watson (a past Heritage Research Assistant) has accepted a planning position with the Province of Alberta. Stephen is currently looking through resumes for the 2012 summer student position.</p> <p>8.2 Potential sale of Norfolk Street United Church (75 Norfolk Street) Stephen Robinson noted that Norfolk Street United Church will be sold. The Committee suggested that staff should talk to the current and new owners about heritage conservation.</p>
9	<p><u>Next Meeting</u></p> <p>Subcommittee Meeting – Monday, February 27, 2012 in City Hall Meeting Room “B” Regular Meeting - Monday, March 12, 2012 in City Hall Meeting Room “B”</p>
10	<p><u>Other Matters Introduced by the Chair or Heritage Guelph Members</u></p> <p>Susan Ratcliffe announced that the annual Grand River Heritage Day event will be held this Friday. Susan Ratcliffe announced that the “Jane’s Walks” are starting to be planned and will be held on the first Saturday and Sunday in May. Susan Ratcliffe announced that a second edition reproduction of the popular 1939 book by David Allan <i>About Guelph: Its Early Days and Later</i> is being published soon by the Guelph Historical Society.</p> <p>Adjourn – 2:10 pm</p>