

Meeting Minutes



City of Guelph

Heritage Guelph Committee (HG)

May 13, 2019

City Hall, Meeting Room C

From 12:00 to 2:00 p.m.

Meeting Chair: P. Brian Skerrett

Present: P. Brian Skerrett, Arlin Otto, Charles Nixon, James Smith, David Waverman, Kesia Kvill, Mary Tivy, Stephen Robinson (Senior Heritage Planner), Madeleine Myhill (Planning Clerk), Arun Hindupur (Supervisor, Infrastructure Engineering), Melissa Aldunate (Manager, Policy Planning and Urban Design)

Absent: Bob Foster, Michael Crawley

Agenda Items

All were welcomed by the Chair.

Items 1, 2 and 3

Item 1, Call to order and review of agenda and addendum

Item 2, Acknowledgements

Item 3, Disclosure of Pecuniary Interest - None

Item 4, Approval of Minutes of the April 8, 2019 meeting.

Moved by: Charles Nixon

Seconded by: Mary Tivy

Carried – unanimous

THAT the minutes of the April 8, 2018 meeting of Heritage Guelph be approved.

Matters Arising from the Minutes

Item 5

191 Waterloo Avenue

Heritage review application (HR19-0001) for proposed removal from Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties.

- Staff presented images and a summary of research to date.
- Subject property had been built upon by 1872 (Guelph Bird's Eye View) and Cooper's 1877 map indicates two buildings on the lot.
- After discussion on the historical associative and contextual value of the property, staff indicated their opinion that it would be difficult to meet any of the three criteria for determining cultural heritage value for individual designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- The committee agreed with staff's suggestion that the property would be a strong contributor to a Waterloo Avenue cultural heritage landscape and that protection may only be practical and possible within a heritage conservation district.
- Committee members suggested that a review of listed properties that have been lost to demolition would be a useful exercise in efforts to maintain a consistent approach,.

Moved by: Charles Nixon

Seconded by: Arlin Otto

Carried – 5 in favour, 2 against

THAT Heritage Guelph finds that 191 Waterloo Avenue does not have significant cultural heritage value to merit designation under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act and, therefore, cannot recommend its retention on the Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Properties.

New Business

Item 6

Draft Cultural Heritage Action Plan (CHAP) released for Council and public comment Discussion of current draft document presented to Council Planning on April 8 2019.

- Concerns were raised as to the prioritization of candidate CHLs in the CHAP
- Committee would like to see a matrix with risk elements identified to show how CHL prioritization was determined
- Special meeting will take place Monday, May 27, 2019 dedicated solely to the CHAP to ensure HG members have opportunity to provide all of their comments
- HG would like project timeline updated as it relates to consultations with HG
- Would like changes documented if possible

Moved by: Arlin Otto

Seconded by: Mary Tivy

AMENDMENT

Moved by: P. Brian Skerret

Seconded by: Kesia Kvill

Carried - unanimous

THAT the draft Cultural Heritage Action Plan included as Attachment 1, to the Infrastructure, Development & Enterprise Services Report (IDE 2019-41), dated April

8, 2019 be received with the caveat that Heritage Guelph did not see the report prior to its presentation on the April 8th, 2019 City Council Agenda.

Item 7

785 York Road

Review of Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment: York Road Environmental Design Study (revised March 2019) prepared for the City of Guelph by Wood Environmental & Infrastructure Solutions.

Delegation: Alex Smith

- The delegate indicated that he was speaking on behalf of the Yorklands Greenhub
- The delegate stated there is a fundamental problem with Clythe Creek re-alignment which obliterates heritage features in the existing watercourse
- The delegate stated that this area and its features are celebrated by Guelph with a pride of place that fosters pride of self for community members and inmates that built these features
- The delegate stated that the existing man-made watercourses were built and maintained by inmates to provide them with skills which constitutes feature of great heritage significance
- The delegate stated concerns that the report only offers mitigation measures and no retention options
- The delegate stated concerns with the number of trees that will need to be removed to accomplish the project

Discussion with Committee:

- Some committee members echoed the delegate's concerns including a perceived abandonment of the watercourse and its heritage features
- Concerns were expressed about proceeding without a Conservation Plan in place
- Discussion around the alternative options proposed by the project
- Discussion around future use of the Clythe Creek area and how residents would interact with this landscape
- Committee feels there is a need to ensure commitment to not just preparing a Conservation Plan, but to follow through with implementation
- Concerns expressed by committee members as to what they feel is a lack of sufficient past consultation on the York Road Environmental Design project

Moved by: P. Brian Skerrett

Seconded by: James Smith

Carried – 6 in favour, 1 against

THAT while Heritage Guelph supports the removal and reconstruction of the stone walls as noted in Table 2, Item #15, of the Cultural Heritage Resource Impact Assessment: York Road Environmental Design Study (revised March 2019) prepared by Wood Environmental & Infrastructure Solutions, Heritage Guelph does not support the conclusions or recommendations in Section 6.0 (1), and only supports the

recommendations in Section 6.0 (2); and that Heritage Guelph be updated by the Senior Heritage Planner during the detailed design stage and be consulted on any proposed draft Conservation Plan involving the York Road widening/Clythe Creek realignment project.

Item 8

29 Waterworks Place

Designated property

Heritage permit HP19-0004

- City of Guelph Waterworks will be creating their main headquarters at 29 Waterworks Place in the designated heritage building known as the Guelph Waterworks Engine House and Pumping Station
- The building is currently being used for equipment storage
- Staff presented images from past site visits as well as the proposed rehabilitation design drawings
- Discussion around how new window openings would be addressed
- Emily Stahl (Waterworks staff) asked for recommendations on new window openings

Moved by: Arlin Otto

Seconded by: Mary Tivy

Carried – unanimous

THAT Heritage Guelph supports heritage permit HP19-0004 to rehabilitate the Guelph Waterworks Engine House and Pumping Station at 29 Waterworks Place as presented at the May 13 2019 meeting of Heritage Guelph; and That any modifications to the design that are minor in nature may be dealt with by the Senior Heritage Planner.

Item 9

83 Essex Street

Heritage permit application HP19-0008 proposing a 1-storey rear addition, partial basement and restoration of front doors. The proposal has also been submitted as Site Plan Review application SP19-010.

- Staff presented images and discussed the proposed restoration of the front doors, the removal of the existing interior vestibule inside the front door and the proposed addition to the rear of the building
- The addition will create an accessible entrance by an entrance ramp and a new opening in the rear stone wall

Moved by: Kesia Kvill

Seconded by: James Smith

Carried – unanimous

THAT Heritage Guelph supports heritage permit HP19-0008 for the proposed 1-storey rear addition, partial basement and restoration of front doors, as presented in drawings by Joel Bartlett Architect Inc. (dated February 14, 2019) at the May 13 2019 meeting of Heritage Guelph; and that any modifications to the design that are minor in nature may be dealt with by the Senior Heritage Planner.

Moved by: Arlin Otto
Seconded by: Kesia Kvill
Carried – unanimous

THAT the meeting be extended to 2:30 p.m.

Moved by: Arlin Otto
Seconded by: Kesia Kvill
Carried – unanimous

THAT the meeting be extended to 3:00 p.m.

Item 10

Heritage Guelph Designation Working Group Report – James Smith

Item 11

Heritage Guelph Outreach Working Group Report – Kesia Kvill

Information Items

1. Committee housekeeping (P. Brian Skerrett)
2. Staff update on questions regarding vacant heritage properties within the City.
3. Rural Heritage Webinar (David Waverman)
4. Ontario Heritage Conference, (May 30-June 1) in Bluewater and Goderich

Next Meetings

Heritage Guelph: May 27, 2019 (12:00 noon-2:00 p.m.) City Hall, Mtg Rm C

Adjournment

Moved by: Kesia Kvill
Seconded by: Arlin Otto
Carried – unanimous